QC stresses need for legal protection for Troubles commission witnesses

In this section

- 'Watchmen' film cert reduced to 16
- Tánaiste orders inquiry into supply chains in retail sector
- Irish Times' suspends supply of newspaper to Dunnes Stores
- Constitutional issues for road law directive
- Ban on smoking in cars gets Minister's support
- Spring show bursts with glamour

FRANK MILLAR, London Editor

THE “INFORMATION recovery” process envisaged by the Eames Bradley report could hamper reconciliation in Northern Ireland by discarding vital legal protections and procedures enshrined in the common law.

That is the view of Peter Smith QC, who served as a member of the Patten Commission on the reform of the RUC.

He was speaking to The Irish Times as Lord Eames and Denis Bradley – co-chairs of the Consultative Group on the Past – prepared to appear before the Northern Ireland Affairs Committee at Westminster.

While certain to face Unionist and Conservative fire over the proposed “recognition” payments to the families of all “victims” of the Troubles, Lord Eames and Mr Bradley might expect some support from MPs for their efforts to meet parliamentary and public concern by capping the cost of future inquiries into past events.
Mr Smith’s intervention, however, seems certain to augment fears that a “cost driven” process could come at the price of justice for some who are eventually summoned to appear before the proposed Independent Legacy Commission.

The Eames-Bradley report lays stress on the need for its proposals to be “human rights compatible” and recognises that witnesses may need access to legal advice.

Against that, Mr Smith said, the apparent guarantee against self-implication sat alongside a power to compel witnesses and the production of papers, in proceedings intended to be non-adversarial, in which it appeared a person accused of serious wrong-doing or criminality would be denied the basic courtroom rights to face his or her accuser, and to challenge them by means of questioning by their lawyer.

“The position in the common law world is that where serious allegations are to be made, an individual must have these rights,” said Mr Smith.

“For any commission or tribunal to adjudicate on a person’s alleged criminal behaviour without these essential safeguards would be revolutionary.”

Mr Smith said he thought any proposal to permit adverse judgments to be made against individuals by the proposed commission without proper legal challenge “would give rise to grave disquiet” among lawyers and human rights activists generally.

While understanding mounting public concern at the costs generated by the Saville Inquiry into Bloody Sunday, Mr Smith also suggested there was no obvious alternative if individuals were to be properly protected.

“If the courts could protect people on their own we would already have dispensed with the need for lawyers,” he said, adding that it was “the dialectic between the prosecution and the defence” which aimed, albeit imperfectly, to establish the truth in legal proceedings.

Raising a lack of clarity about the scale and extent of the legal representation to be made available to people brought before the proposed commission, Mr Smith said that even the ability to be questioned by his or her own lawyer could be as vital to an accused person’s interests during proceedings as the cross-examination of witnesses.

These rules, he stressed, were designed not only to protect individuals “but to ensure that the court or tribunal does not come to the wrong conclusion”.

Mr Smith said he believed the importance of protecting individuals in any search for truth could not be overstated, given the commission’s potential power to require admissions from witnesses that could destroy their reputations, or, in some cases at least, put their lives at risk.

This article appears in the print edition of the Irish Times
Most Emailed

1. Working women almost certainly caused the credit crunch
2. New budget and higher taxes likely as consensus emerges
3. Bono 'hurt' by criticism of U2 move to Netherlands to cut tax
4. Ryanair turns on blogger who found website glitch
5. Bono rejects criticism of U2 tax status

Most Shared

1. Working women almost certainly caused the credit crunch
2. Ryanair considers coining it with lavatory levy
3. Anglo Irish may get private equity offer - report
4. Bono 'hurt' by criticism of U2 move to Netherlands to cut tax
5. Just the 2 of U

Your Vote

Yes
No

Results

Do you think the Government should introduce a new budget in light of the worsening Exchequer finances?

Crossword Club »

Today's Interactive Irish Times Crosaire and Simplex crosswords, plus 10 years of crossword archive.

Sudoku »

Download and print the daily Irish Times sudoku grid

Hughie O'Donoghue

Artist Hughie O'Donoghue describes his work in a photo-essay by Irish Times photographer Bryan O'Brien. An extensive interview with the artist will appear in tomorrow's edition of the Weekend supplement.

Music in search of Utopia

Tchaikovsky's romantic opera, ‘Mazeppa’, is likely to be better appreciated at its Irish premiere this weekend than in the composer's homeland, writes Eileen Batterby.

A bit too pretty in pink?

In an era of aggressive gender-specific marketing, Ita O'Kelly looks at the dangers of stereotyping children.

Anorexia and you

Fiona McCarrn’s article about her journey through anorexia attracted a huge response from those affected by similar issues.

No Line On The Horizon

U2 release their new album today and The Ticket has the inside story, with interviews, reader reviews and more.