

cc Mr. B. *me*

ST 216

*this log file
has is of little interest
to us from an HE viewpoint.
A copy to Dr. Browne
for information*

24/9.

- cc: PS/Sir John Wheeler (DFP, B&L) - B
- PS/Mr Atkins (DED, DOE&L) - B
- PS/Lord Arran (DANI, DHSS&L) - B
- PS/Michael Ancram (DENI, B&L) - B
- PS/PUS (B&L) - B
- Mr Fell
- Mr Semple
- Mr Loughran
- Mr Elliott
- Mr Watkins
- Mr Spence
- Mr Wood
- Dr Harbison
- Mr Hewitt
- Mr Jardine
- Mr McCusker

From: Mr J A Canavan
CCRU

23 September 1993

To: PS/Secretary of State (B&L) - B

UNIVERSITY OF ULSTER RESEARCH ON CATHOLIC AND PROTESTANT INCOME DIFFERENCES

1. Today's newspapers (and yesterday's Irish Independent which broke the embargo) carry prominent reports of the presentation at yesterday's Towards 2000 Conference at Newcastle by Professor Vani Borooah of research carried out at the University of Ulster on "Catholic/Protestant Income Differences in Northern Ireland". The press has covered the story with varying emphasis, newspapers sympathetic to the nationalist perspective stressing that Catholic weekly family income is on average £14.00 less than that for Protestants, while the Newsletter claims that the research refutes allegations of discrimination.
2. These differing slants are indicative of the problems which arise when the findings of complex sociological

TC95

research are compressed into press statement form. Officials in CCRU and PPRU have reservations about the weight of interpretation which is being placed on a fairly limited piece of research. It was based on the Family Expenditure Survey for 1989 and 1990, covering approximately 1,500 households, ie an annual sample of 1% of households. The sample is therefore rather small, especially if disaggregations into employed/unemployed, benefit recipients/others, and Catholic/Protestant are made. On this fairly narrow basis, detailed computations seem to have been made about differentials between the communities. The essence of the conclusions about differentials is well known to officials and does not add substantially to existing knowledge. However, the press summary has put a slant on the findings which is open to misinterpretation by the media, ie that "the gap between the "haves" and "have nots" (irrespective of religion) should be emphasised rather than focusing exclusively - as public discussion in inequality in Northern Ireland tends to do - upon differences between Catholics and Protestants". This might be read as a claim that the vertical socio-economic divisions between the two communities are a spurious issue and that the real problem is the horizontal divisions between rich and poor.

3. The Government's Targeting Social Need priority is about the targeting of resources at the highest levels of objectively defined social and economic need, wherever it occurs in the community. It will benefit all those in the lowest income bracket, but because of the differentials in need, will impact more on the Catholic community. To that extent, there is no real divergence of approach between the Government's policy and the analysis in this study.

Edgar (Haligan)
5/16

4. Mr Fell has responded to has advance copy of the press summary sent by the Rowntree Foundation, which sponsored the study, and has indicated that PPRU is undertaking a more detailed analysis of the research work. PPRU have identified a number of specific points of unease with the research which, until they are resolved, would suggest that the findings should be treated with some caution. I am enclosing to recipients of my minute to Mr Fell of 20 September a copy of a more detailed analysis by Mr Jardine of PPRU of the research summary sent to Mr Fell by the Rowntree Foundation.

EXECUTIVE TRAINING COMPETITION AND CANDIDATE BACKGROUND

1. In your minute to Dr Brown of 14 June you asked for comments on how the performance of school leavers compares with the experience found in the Civil Service.
[Signed: JAC]

2. The performance of 1991/92 school leavers by religion (based on school management type) and gender was as follows:-

J A CANAVAN

	MALES		FEMALES	
	SC	PROT	SC	PROT
2+ A Levels	22.3	23.1	32.0	33.6
2+ GCE (A-C)	27.0	28.3	31.1	32.1
1+ GCE (A-C)	22.0	27.3	31.3	31.5
(SC Test Score)	(203.9)	(212.8)	(284.1)	(297.9)

3. While it is clear from the above that Protestant school leavers are generally doing better than Catholic school leavers, it is also clear that females are doing better than males. Indeed, there is very little difference in terms of achievement between Protestant females and Catholic females. The pattern of results found in the SC tests, however, differs from the pattern of school leavers' qualifications in respect of male/female differences generally (with males performing better than females in the tests) and in respect of differences found between Protestant females and Catholic females (with the tests producing a much wider gap between the 2 groups).

4. I was unable to evaluate achievement patterns in Maths, as information is not presently collected on individual subject exam results by religion.

TC95

24/9/92/251807