



**An Chartlann Náisiúnta**  
**National Archives**

**Reference Code:** 2021/95/23

**Creator(s):** Department of the Taoiseach

**Accession Conditions:** Open

**Copyright:** National Archives, Ireland.  
May only be reproduced with  
the written permission of the  
Director of the National  
Archives.

Costs of Violence and  
Cross-Border Security Co-operation  
Background Note

General

1. The heightened awareness of the prospects for ending the conflict has drawn attention to the costs of the conflict in human and economic terms. Since 1969, there have been 3,107 deaths in Northern Ireland. In addition, there have been 71 related fatalities in the Republic and 120 in Great Britain (plus 15 in continental Europe). The number of injured is in excess of 30,000.

Costs of violence

2. It is estimated that the total cost of the "troubles" since 1969 is IRE22.6 billion (Stg£21.5 billion), of which approximately Stg£18 billion has been met by Britain. According to up-dated figures prepared in the Division, the breakdown is as follows:

	Security	Economic	Total
Ireland	IRE2,518m	IRE1,200m	IRE3,718m
G. B. /N. I.	Stg£11,765m	Stg£6,230m	Stg£17,995m

An analysis of the costs in both jurisdictions is included below.

Security Cooperation

3. Cross-border security co-operation receives regular and intensive consideration at meetings within the framework of the Anglo-Irish Intergovernmental Conference as well as at frequent meetings between the respective police forces. The Secretary of State and the RUC Chief Constable have both recently reiterated their previously expressed view that security cooperation is working effectively and that relations between the Gardai and the RUC are very good. The Minister responsible for security at the NIO, Sir John Wheeler, travelled to Dublin on 16/17 November 1993 for a detailed briefing from the Minister for Justice and senior Garda representatives.

Security successes

4. The British have acknowledged the work of the Gardai in seizing arms, explosives and ammunition, and in particular, the significant finds made over the past year. Since 1985 the amount of firearms, ammunition and explosives seized by the Gardai is equivalent to if not greater than the amounts recovered by the Northern Ireland Security Forces. In 1992 some 383 firearms, 79,660 rounds of ammunition and 5,244 lbs of explosives were recovered in Garda search operations. In 1993, up until 21 October 1993, a total of 307 firearms, 24,722 ammunition rounds and 3,078 lbs of explosives were found.
  
5. Recent significant arms finds include a large quantity of home made explosives along with weapons and a rocket launcher in Co. Donegal in August, a substantial quantity of weapons in a "training camp" in Louth in September, four separate finds in October in Co. Louth and a large explosives find during a routine search of a deserted house in Co. Donegal in November 1993. The Northern Security Minister, Sir John Wheeler, stated in the House of Commons in late October 1993 that cooperation between the Gardai and the RUC was at its highest level ever.

Successful court convictions

6. Other recent security successes include the arrest and conviction of the Brixton prison escapees Nessian Quinlivan and Pearse McAuley. Quinlivan was jailed for four years in the Special Criminal Court in October 1993, while McAuley was sentenced to 7 years imprisonment on 18 November 1993. Within the Conference, Sir Patrick Mayhew had earlier expressed satisfaction at the decision of the Courts to remand both in custody. Undoubtedly, their sentencing will give cause for greater satisfaction. The fact that, over the past five years to the end of October

1993, more than three-quarters of persons charged before the Special Criminal Court (140 out of 186) were convicted is an indication of the ability of the legal system in this jurisdiction to deal with terrorist offenders.

Cost of Northern Ireland violence to the State

7. The success of the Gardai in relation to arms finds reflects the sustained commitment of significant resources in the security area. The extra security costs to this State arising out of the Northern Ireland situation amounted to £210 million in 1992, compared with £199 million in 1991. In 1993, the cost was £199 million for the first three quarters of the year alone. Since 1969, it is estimated that the Exchequer has incurred expenditure of more than £2.5 billion on additional security costs. On a per capita basis, it is estimated that the Irish taxpayer pays up to three times more than the British taxpayer on security costs attributable to the Northern Ireland situation.

Increasing costs to Britain

8. While there are no obvious indications of dissatisfaction with the level of security cooperation, there are signs that IRA bomb attacks in Britain, most spectacularly at Bishopsgate in April, have led to debate inside the British system on the adequacy of existing security policies. The extent of damage caused to commercial buildings both in Britain and in Belfast and towns such as Portadown and Magherafelt in Northern Ireland has focussed attention on the financial cost of the conflict. Since 1969, in excess of £1,438 million sterling has been paid out in Northern Ireland in criminal compensation. The forecast for criminal damage costs in Northern Ireland for 1993/94 is £92.8m and for criminal injury £26.4m. It is estimated that the total expenditure on security in the North will exceed £913 million in 1993.

9. In Britain, damage caused by the Bishopsgate bomb is estimated at £400 million, half of which will have to be picked up by the British Government. A further sign of increased concern in the British business community was the announcement on 17 November 1993 of a £1 million reward for information leading to the arrest and prosecution of terrorists. Indeed, concern to maintain the City of London as a major financial centre in the face of threats by insurers to withdraw cover has obliged the British Government to introduce legislation to enable it to act as insurer of last resort for commercial and industrial property.
10. The cost of violence in Northern Ireland has received prominent coverage in the influential "Economist" magazine recently. In the current year, expenditure by the NIO on law and order in Northern Ireland will be £902m, while the Ministry of Defence will spend an extra £477m in maintaining troops in Northern Ireland. The total annual British subvention to Northern Ireland, including extra army costs, is approx. £3.5 bn (the Economist magazine calculated that it is equivalent to a subsidy of £2,370 for each resident of Northern Ireland).

#### Cross-border Co-operation

11. Following discussion at recent Summits, including that in Downing Street in June 1993, it was envisaged that the Taoiseach and the Prime Minister would review progress in security cooperation. To this end, a number of specific proposals have been under consideration within a group chaired by the Secretary of the Department of Justice and the NIO Permanent Secretary (Dalton/Chilcot). In the Conference framework, the British side have recently pushed the idea of border flight safety zones which would allow a significant incursions by British aircraft in the course of approaches to and from British bases on the

course of approaches to and from British bases on the border. The Irish side have drawn attention in the Conference to the very serious difficulties to which this proposal gives rise:

- the scale and frequency of such incursions, (up to 540 per month), would be greatly resented by the local community who would view it as an unacceptable erosion of sovereignty. The resulting political controversy would be harmful to cooperation with the security forces, to the detriment of security on both sides of the border
- there would be no means of guaranteeing the safety of the helicopters in our jurisdiction, particularly since no advance notice would be given. The risk of an attack by subversives on a British aircraft south of the border is too high to be acceptable
- the changes sought, and the furore which would ensue, would provide a propaganda windfall for paramilitaries and their supporters

In view of the continuing differences on this issue, it has been agreed within the Dalton/Chilcot framework to report to the Heads of Government at a later meeting.

#### Extradition and Bail

12. The British side have shown particular interest over recent months in progress on the promised legislation on Extradition. It has been indicated in the Conference that the Government intend to introduce amending legislation before the Christmas recess. The British have been briefed in general terms on the legislation through Working Group II of the Anglo-Irish Conference. Irish draft proposals for related legislation on specialty were handed to the British on 1 November; analogous British proposals are to be formulated after discussions with the Irish side.



Bail

13. The granting of bail by our courts to persons being sought by the British authorities on extradition warrants is a matter of long-standing complaint by the British Government, and was referred to by Prime Minister Major in a reply to a Westminster PQ on 14 April 1993. This followed controversy arising from the case of Paul Magee. Magee absconded from this jurisdiction while on bail pending an appeal to the Supreme Court against his extradition. In the event he lost his appeal. Magee was arrested in England in July 1992 following the shooting dead of a policeman. He subsequently received a life sentence for the murder of the policeman and related offences. There was also press criticism of the decision to allow bail in the case of Angelo Fusco with prominence being given to photographs of him fishing while the relatives of those killed in the Warrington bombing grieved. The fact remains that the State continues to press for extradition in the Fusco case; the terms of bail, which continue to be honoured, are of course a matter for the courts.
  
14. The courts in our jurisdiction have ruled that the right to bail is guaranteed by the Constitution, and consequently a referendum would be needed to change the present position. In Northern Ireland bail is granted by the courts in almost 50% of terrorist cases.

Anglo-Irish Division

2 December, 1993

A664

SUMMARY OF EXTRA COSTS TO IRELAND (1969- CURRENT)  
ARISING OUT OF THE SECURITY SITUATION IN NORTHERN IRELAND

1. EXCHEQUER COSTS	IRE million (Nominal prices)
1.1 Security costs	2, 518 <sup>1</sup>
This figure comprises the Justice Vote, (including a percentage of costs associated with compensation for criminal damage and criminal injuries, costs associated with the forensic science laboratory and criminal legal aid), as well as a percentage of the Votes for Prisons, Gardai and Courts. It also includes the additional costs for the Defence Forces which are caused by the provision of border security.	
2. ECONOMIC COSTS	
2.1 Damage to Tourism	1, 130 <sup>2</sup>
2.2 Capital and trading costs due to the destruction of the electricity inter-connector	70
TOTAL	IRE 3, 718 million STGE 3, 543 million

---

<sup>1</sup>This figure is a total of the nominal annual values, as recorded by the Dept of Justice, since 1969.

<sup>2</sup>The figure for loss of tourism earnings relates to the period 1975-1982 only, and is expressed in 1982 prices. Bord Failte have not produced any estimates since that date.



SUMMARY OF EXTRA COSTS TO GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IRELAND  
ARISING OUT OF THE SECURITY SITUATION (1969- CURRENT)

1. EXCHEQUER COSTS	STG£ million (Nominal prices)
1.1 Extra Security costs	10,327
1.2 Compensation for deaths, criminal injuries and criminal damage	1,438
2. ECONOMIC COSTS	
2.1 Cumulative lost output 1969-1991	6,018 <sup>3</sup>
2.2 Capital and trading costs due to the destruction of the electricity inter-connector	212 <sup>4</sup>
TOTAL	STG£ 17,995 million IR£ 18,882 million

---

<sup>3</sup>This total includes tourism-related economic costs for the period 1969-1982. No further estimates of these costs have been produced

<sup>4</sup>Capital costs for 1992-93 are not available